Causes and Nature of Educational Neglect in German Research

Abstract. The relevance of the study is conditioned by the need to find out the causes of pedagogical neglect of adolescents in the context of German experience and identify possible solutions to this problem. The purpose of the study is to highlight the main views of German researchers on the diagnosis of pedagogical neglect and its further correction. From a methodological standpoint, the study is based on the content analysis method, which is one of the tools for conducting desk research. The studies by K. Lissmann, W. Von Humboldt, R.D. Precht, P. Wisner, G. Kindler were considered. The main problems that ensure educational neglect in Germany have been identified: insufficient funding, lack of highly qualified staff, misdirection of skills and qualities of students, low level of social security, etc. An important factor is the quality of relationships between teenagers and other people (parents, teachers, friends), as well as their parents with them. Recommendations were outlined for solving the above-mentioned problematic issues, which is the practical significance of the study. In particular, it is necessary to: increase funding to ensure the organisation of the educational process, increase the number of quotas in teachers' universities, develop a new educational programme that will meet European standards, but at the same time not harm the local education system, ensure social protection of all participants in the educational process.

Keywords: educational process, level of education, highly qualified personnel, Bologna declaration, PISA

INTRODUCTION

A high-quality educational process is the basis for a developed, highly qualified, innovative society, which is a fundamental factor in building an economically stable state. In 2000, a test of the Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA) was conducted for the first time [1], which revealed a number of problems in the German education system. The test results obtained in 2001 led to a media outcry called the “PISA shock”. Since then, problems in the German educational sphere have become the subject of inquiry by many German researchers, but now the geography of research on this topic is expanding and extending beyond the borders of Germany. After all, it is important for the scientific community of each developing country to study the experience of countries trying to solve the problems of educational neglect in order to find solutions to such problems for their country.

Germany still has not solved the problems that were discovered after the first test of the Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA) [1]. The results of the audit showed that the educational level of schoolchildren in the country is below average. For example, it turned out that 15-year-olds read at the primary school level and do not understand the texts they read [2-4]. It is worth noting that there are no literature lessons in German schools. Even in high schools, children read no more than two thin books a year. Therefore, it is not surprising that children do not have any experience in reading and analysing texts. Low test results according to the selected criteria led to a number of reforms recommended by the OECD [5-7].

The essence of the reforms is to move from a system of acquiring knowledge to a system of acquiring skills. The question of what kind of education really takes place splits German society into two camps. Special features of the German school system and its structure, which distinguish it from other European countries, are:

- selection of students in different types of schools and their distribution along educational trajectories in accordance with academic performance, abilities, and aptitudes (interests);
- differentiated approach to the educational process in the distribution of students by trajectories, trends, and groups of school performance.
These features are most clearly manifested in the example of the initial stage of the school education system, on the one hand, due to too early selection, considering the abilities of children, both younger schoolchildren and preschoolers, on the school readiness exam when entering the 1st grade; on the other hand – by replacing stimulating learning with a result-oriented selection process, which leads to an increase in the number of students lagging behind in learning, and the appearance of “second-year students” already in the 1st grade [8].

Unlike the European experience of creating a single secondary school, in Germany, a single school extends only to four years of primary school education, after which 10-year primary school graduates are divided into unequal secondary schools in terms of level and prospects for further education. For comparison, in the Scandinavian countries, which are carefully studied by German specialists, children are offered not only equal opportunities, but also equal results. In Finland, for example, repetition is considered pedagogically and economically meaningless. In Sweden, differentiation by academic performance is prohibited by law. In Germany, neither early differentiation nor the selection of students based on their abilities and academic achievements has been abolished by law, which takes precedence over methods of improving academic performance.

Most of the German experts who analysed the results of the international PISA study [6; 7; 9; 10–13], called the preservation of the “outdated” structure of the school system the main reason for the poor academic performance of German schoolchildren, and the proposed measures to modernise the education system may not bring effective results in their opinion. The agenda included the task of revising and reassessing pedagogical values, quality as a pedagogical category, rethinking the attitude to the assessment of pedagogical activities, the education management system at all levels and its optimisation.

One of the proponents of competence research is the well-known German philosopher and publicist R.D. Precht. He claims that more than half of the material passed at school is forgotten, which means that the material does not have to be memorised [9]. At the same time, he notes that using the Google search engine for educational purposes requires basic knowledge, otherwise, such a huge flow of information can simply be lost. R. Precht also suggests that the role of teachers in schools should be kept to a minimum [9]. The teacher does not know the material as prominent researchers and university teachers do, so there is no need to listen to them. It is much more reasonable to watch a video on the desired topic on YouTube. This position clearly shows the influence of the ideology of large IT corporations.

The study of scientific sources of German researchers on the problem of ignoring education shows that researchers have tried to identify the causes of pedagogical neglect of adolescents and investigate diagnostic tools and approaches to solving this problem. This issue is related to such important scientific and practical tasks as the development of professional competence of future teachers and the fostering of tolerance. The German experience is especially important in this aspect for Ukraine, since Germany is marked by democratic traditions and its focus on the establishment of personal independence of citizens in conditions of maximum responsibility and organisation. The areas of studying this problem in Germany are multi-level, i.e., humanistic foundations of education, social aspects of pedagogical neglect, and tools for diagnosing pedagogical neglect. However, the opinion of German researchers in solving this problem was not covered by Ukrainian researchers.

The purpose of the study is to highlight the opinion of German researchers on the diagnosis of pedagogical neglect and its further correction.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

The material basis of this study is the scientific publications by German philosophers, professors, teachers, and other figures of the educational sphere, who analysed the modern German education system and identified its shortcomings. Sources were selected using methods of information collection, such as content analysis. Content analysis is a method by which a researcher collects information about the investigated phenomenon. The basis of any research is scientific sources, so it is important to work through as many sources as possible for a complete overview of the object, identifying its fundamental characteristics, problematic issues, and the degree of study to formulate a research goal. The search for sources was carried out in databases such as Scopus, Google Academy, various German-language electronic resources, etc.

Thus, the conducted study represents a desk research. Such research is carried out based on the processing and systematisation of information collected using open (or in some cases closed) databases of scientific sources to determine the level of coverage of the problem under study. Desk research is more related to market research, but in this case, it was used to achieve a scientific goal. Desk research provides the implementation of the following tasks: investigation of a wide range of characteristics of the object under study; identification of problematic issues that are not yet sufficiently covered in the scientific literature, assessment of the current state of the object under study; comparative analysis of information from various sources; systematisation of the information obtained.

The study included several stages. At the first stage, scientific sources were selected and subsequently analysed. The main criterion for selecting sources was their relevance, that is, compliance with the topic, originality, and no less important factor was authority, so the object of research were papers by only recognised figures in the educational sphere. Thus, the papers by such scholars as R.D. Precht [9], K. Lissmann [10], R. Wiesner [11], H. Kindler et al. [12], V. von Humboldt [14] and others were reviewed, and their views on the problems in the German education system were highlighted. At the next stage, the study analysed the Bologna declaration, which has a great impact on the educational process in many European countries, as well as the Programme

Scientific Bulletin of Mukachevo State University. Series “Pedagogy and Psychology”, Vol. 8, No. 2
for International Student Assessment (PISA), whose unsatisfactory results in 2001 gave rise to numerous studies on the problem of educational neglect in Germany. At the final stage, all the information obtained at the previous stages was structured and presented in the form of a paper.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

K. Lissmann [10], a philosopher, professor, and lecturer in philosophy and ethics at the University of Vienna, is one of the most vocal critics of new reforms in the education system of German-speaking countries: Germany, Austria, and Switzerland. In his opinion, the new reforms are reduced to the acquisition of skills, and the role of the teacher is reduced to the initial definition of a teacher in Ancient Greece, where the teacher was a slave who had to take care of seven-year-olds, accompany them to school, and make sure that nothing happened to them on the way. The teacher, according to Lissman, plays a major role in the educational process. Basic knowledge gained at school expands the worldview and opens up the world to people [10].

According to the prominent German thinker V. von Humboldt [14], a person who has received a good education and learned to think is quickly able to master a new profession. There are a lot of interesting lectures on YouTube, but this is a one-sided perception, in such training courses there is a complete lack of discussion and exchange of opinions. A person can listen to a lot of lectures on any topic and not understand its meaning. The teacher can tell the child which lectures to watch and which books to read. It is well known that the YouTube platform often keeps users in a so-called “information bubble” when it offers videos on similar topics and often from the same point of view.

The definition of competence is very abstract. If one person considers themself more competent than the other, and this judgment is very subjective. According to the Swiss primary school curriculum, students between the ages of 6 and 12 must master 4,500 skills that must be tested later. When calculating the number of hours of training, it turns out that the student is given 2 minutes to acquire each competence. What can a child learn in 2 minutes? “For example, each action can be reduced to competence: the child can concentrate on the teacher for a while when they speak. Ability is important, but not so great to be called competence,” writes Lissmann [10]. In his book “Theory of ignorance: mistakes of the knowledge society”, the researcher writes that information should not be confused with knowledge, and a cursory reading of short articles on the Internet does not provide a deep understanding of the subject, and without basic knowledge, it is impossible to determine whether an article is legitimate or merely false propaganda.

Thus, modern society is not a society of knowledge, but a society of information and data. Reducing education only to mastering competencies kills the main goal – the development of a person who is not only ready to contribute to the development of science, art, and civilisation in general, but also able to take responsibility for their own actions in relation to humanity. That is why students need not only mathematics, physics, and chemistry, but also literature, history, philosophy, music, and art.

Nowadays, Germany spends 4.2% of GDP on education, which is relatively small compared to other OECD member countries. Norway, for example, spends 6.4% of GDP on education. “If Germany increased spending on education to the level of Norway, the education system would receive EUR 66.9 billion more than before,” says A. Klinger [13], one of the chairmen of the German Education Union (GEW). With more than 300,000 vacant jobs and a shortage of more than 120,000 kindergarten teachers, the shortage of skilled workers will increase to 583,000 by 2025.

According to a new study by the Bertelsmann Foundation [15], the situation in German primary schools is much worse than the same foundation predicted a year ago. Catastrophic shortage of teachers: by 2025, the shortage of primary school teachers will amount to 26,300 people. The situation with high school teachers is no better. Two-thirds of Berlin’s teachers do not have a teacher education. The state failed to calculate in advance the number of children born and the year of their admission to school in order to prepare teachers by this time. The current situation is critical. Schools have no teachers and no money: more than EUR 35 billion are needed to repair roofs, classrooms, and toilets.

German universities have also increased the number of students, but not teachers. Classrooms are crowded, and there are often more than a hundred students per professor. The Hamburg University of Technology (TU Hamburg-Harburg) has only 91 out of 140 faculty vacancies are filled, and the quality of teaching and research suffers due to a lack of funds and teachers.

The biggest irritant in German education is two Italian words – Bologna [16] and the already mentioned PISA (Programme for International Student Assessment) [1], an abbreviation that coincides with the name of the Italian city of Pisa. The signing of the Bologna declaration in 1999 had a major impact on the reforms in the German higher education system [16]. The goal of the reform is to standardise the higher education system in Europe so that students can freely transfer from a university in one country to a university in another country, and their degrees and qualifications can be recognised.

As a result, a system of bachelor's degree (three-year course) and master's degree (two-year course after obtaining a bachelor's degree) was introduced in Germany. Because of this, according to German professors, the level of higher education has fallen sharply, and the number of dropouts has sharply increased. The university is designed to train scientists and conduct research, and the reforms have turned it into a training channel for low-skilled professionals. Due to lack of funds, the number of vacant jobs in the municipal administration is limited, so most students are satisfied with a bachelor's degree. There is also no need to talk about the emergence of high student mobility, only 10% of students continue their education in other European countries.

One of the many school reforms was to reduce gymnasium classes by one year. Previously, they studied for nine
years, now only eight, but the number of lessons remained unchanged. As a result, children often stay in school longer than their parents work. In the classroom, more time is spent on PowerPoint presentations than on reading books and gaining knowledge. Schools also started running numerous tests, as if the goal of school education was just to complete them. Notably, the preparation and conduct of tests are financed from German tax revenues. The need for testing schoolchildren around the world is highly questionable, according to academics and university professors from various countries. Globalisation and standardisation of education around the world does not lead to its improvement, but only enriches the industry of training and conducting tests.

R. Wiesner [11] considers educational neglect as a prolonged or repeated action or omission in relation to a third party on the part of parents or other caregivers, which can lead to a significant violation of the physical and/or mental development of adolescents. The researcher notes that neglect of such benefits of children as their food, clothing, medical care, social contacts, support, protection and control by parents or guardians leads to irreversible changes and consequences. However, active ignoring is rare, but can be mostly passive due to a lack or inadequate understanding of parental responsibilities. According to the researcher, this is persistent neglect due to rejection of their needs or subsequent rejection, which leads to a violation of their physical, mental or moral development. Failures, as noted by R. Wiesner [11], can be observed in those who are particularly dependent on their age or disability, their parents, and the need for care and protection. It provides a basic relationship between parents and their children.

Physical neglect is defined in the papers of German researchers as negligence and disregard for public health, which can lead to global consequences. This is conditioned by a lack of food, the availability of clean clothes, hygiene products, housing, and medical institutions. Information and pedagogical neglect is considered as a lack of communication and educational influence, irregular school attendance, delinquency or drug addiction, and evasion of specific and important educational needs. Emotional alienation is characterised by a lack of warmth in a relationship with a teenager and emotional reactions.

Thus, German researchers emphasise the role of parents in the emergence of pedagogical neglect in adolescents and call for the study and introduction of an active parental attitude to the well-being of a teenager (compared to a passive attitude) as a means of overcoming and preventing educational neglect. Risking a teenager's well-being: this is primarily a legal dimension. According to the German Federal Court, the risk to the well-being of children and adolescents under § 1666 p. 1 [17] occurs in the presence or directly predicted and established threat to the development of a teenager, which implies or is expected to cause significant physical, mental, or emotional harm (trauma) in the future.

When harm has already been done and the adolescent's well-being is at risk, the protection procedure under § 8a of SGB VIII now requires education professionals to submit a request to the youth office. According to § 8 of SGB VIII, the Youth Office should analyse the risk of danger when working with academic staff [17]. In this regard, R. Wisner [11] emphasises that effective protection of a teenager should be carried out in all possible dangerous situations. The term "child welfare," according to R. Wiesner [11], is an indefinite legal term that, like "danger to the well-being of the child," has ceased to be a category objectively assessed using specific measurement methods. The legal term "protection of children and adolescents" is actually an open concept that is intentionally not defined to allow officials considering a case to individually decide whether the child/adolescent welfare is at risk and what measures are relevant [11].

In § 1697 of the federal law, the concept of "child/adolescent welfare" is widespread in Germany in court decisions [17]. It states that the court has the right to intervene and execute decisions that are most in accordance with the law, considering the actual circumstances, opportunities, and interests of the parties in the welfare of the child/teenager. In fact, there is a general meaning to the commonly accepted interpretation of the legal definition of "child/adolescent welfare". This is why court decisions based on the results of medical and social research are not universal. Some experts believe that any disregard of parents for their duties provokes a risk to the welfare of a teenager and causes educational negligence. This neglect can be detected at a low, average, or high level, but in any case, it is the cause of pedagogical neglect in a teenager [17].

The only significant socio-political decision remains: what level of parental education is insufficient, and in what case the intervention of teachers and public organisations is necessary. To address this problem, studies by H. Kindler [18], M. Conen [19], W. Krieger [20], G. Kindler et al. [12] should be highlighted. This is the creation of a teen protection system or the creation of a new system, where diagnostic resources focus on relatively clear recognition of failure, even if this means that some cases are left without proper attention and a less accurate indication of the danger actually exists. German researchers for the first time raised the question of the disrespectful attitude to the well-being of the child. An example is the position of the German association for private and general welfare, which offered some evidence.

Within the framework of the Office of the National Conference of Young Leaders of Baden-Württemberg and a charity organisation led by the Archdiocese of Freiburg, teachers were asked to fill out a structured questionnaire with open answers to the questions about disrespectful attitude to learning. Analysis of data obtained by experts from the Baden-Württemberg office showed that about 20% of responses indicated physical negligence as the main sign of neglect [21]. The survey managed to find out the most common physical signs of neglect. While physical negligence was reported in 58%, including cases related to lack of hygiene combined with lack of medical care, and inadequate
clothing, 28% were in a state of malnutrition and, as a result, constant hunger. Other responses included sleep deprivation and other forms. Thus, to determine whether a teenager is neglected, it is necessary to be able to observe them for a long time and be able to discuss the observations with other researchers and teachers who deal with this problem.

For example, the North Rhine-Westphalia Ministry of Family Affairs in North Rhine-Westphalia tested a social project to identify early signs of disrespectful attitudes towards learning. The “Herner project” is characterised by the fact that it is based on early failure prevention based on the analysis of various schools as an experimental basis of research. The relevant early warning system has been deployed in the following areas: child neglect (Bielefeld), disregard for the environment (Emmerich), children’s behavioural problems (Herner), the role of the institution (Dortmund), and educational problems (Siegen-Wittgenstein). The basis of the early prevention system is the timely detection of the first signs of the risk of educational neglect and the use of screening tools, such as early diagnosis of families with an increased risk of neglect or ignoring children [4; 5].

Individual risk factors, which have formed the basis for the formation of certain groups, have different effects on the risk associated with ill-treatment or neglect, and are different risk factors for pedagogical neglect. In addition, according to Kindler, certain characteristics of a child, such as a severe temperament or disability, illness, or behavioural disorder, should not be considered as strong prognostic risk factors for educational neglect. The researcher points to the need to pay priority attention to the characteristics of parents, since in such cases the risk of educational neglect of adolescents becomes more noticeable.

G. Kindler [12] notes that reporting a threat to children’s social protection is the first step in processing factors of educational neglect. About six steps need to be added: finding contacts and information; assessing the child’s welfare risk; child / adolescent care processes; court intervention in family matters; aid assessment; and change processes. A certificate from another person is credited to employees of institutions such as schools, the health care system, the police, etc.

Such research is the task of properly trained specialists (for example, an employee of the Youth Affairs Department). Relevant explanations can be obtained, for example, through the Stuttgart general child protection certificate (R. Reich), which was developed for use by specialists of the association that manages secondary schools in Germany, and can only be used after suspicion of danger. It covers all signs of neglect and all forms of threat to the child [12].

The “Herner project” was already mentioned above, which can be considered as an integrated approach, and the “SoFrüh” project was implemented in its context. The “SoFrüh” project is aimed at investigating the situation in kindergartens regarding the early detection of factors that cause educational neglect. Its goal is to develop and implement a system that allows families to provide the necessary assistance in solving the problems of orphanhood and transferring children to other institutions. Tools and methods for monitoring behavioural problems in children from three to six years of age have been developed (presented in the so-called “Herner materials”). Based on the results of observation, various means of overcoming the educational neglect of children were developed and implemented. Measures that, according to experts, can lead to qualitative changes include the following regulations:

- support the development of preschoolers at an early stage (that is, not from 5-6 years, but from 3-4 years);
- introduce the concept of a “new culture of learning” into school practice: assigning and taking on personal responsibility for learning, equated to fulfilling a public duty;
- increase the responsibility of teachers for their teaching activities and the success of their students within the framework of one concept;
- provide students with a competent, future-oriented education to deepen their knowledge and skills and apply them in practice;
- implement the principle of equal educational opportunities;
- improve the continuing education system;
- achieve the quality of education at the international level.

For a long time, the conservative traditions of the German education system prevented more decisive changes in line with European educational trends. Despite noticeable qualitative and quantitative changes, the expansion of educational services and opportunities, in the German education system there are still such negative aspects as: “second year” (on average 5-6%); “graduates” leaving school without a certificate (8.2% of German students and 19.5% of children of foreign citizens); it is much necessary to expand the share of tutoring and state educational services (through school teachers, consulting organisations, extracurricular activities); the claim of universities that they are reducing the level of preparation of applicants and the increase in the drop-out rate of first-year students as evidence of the lower requirements for quality secondary education, the coverage of which by high school students has risen from 25% in 1980 to 35% in 2013.

The stability of the academic performance assessment system was tested “for strength” when the educational prospects that opened up “pushed” an unconventional contingent of students to once elite educational institutions. Teachers had to reduce the requirements for evaluating their academic achievements, to which the authorities responded by tightening the rules for certifying applicants and enrolling them in universities. The conservatism of the German system of control of pedagogical and educational activities, the stability of forms and methods of evaluating school practice established by the management service, prevent the rapid penetration of new trends, theoretical ideas, and concepts into the education system.

The famous German philosopher J. Nida-Ryumin [22], a lecturer at the University of Munich and former minister of culture, argues in numerous speeches and in the book
“Academic mistakes – the crisis of professional and academic education” that the country does not need a large number of people with higher education. As a result of the reforms, there is an acute shortage of highly qualified workers, which directly affects the quality of production and the country's image in the world. However, a number of German and Austrian scientists and philosophers argue that humanity has the ability to determine what and how it uses modern technology, and not allow technology to destroy society. E. Bernays [23], one of the greatest public relations experts, remarked in his 1928 book "Propaganda": “as for ethics, the situation with propaganda in education is the same as with propaganda in business or politics. It can be abused. With its help, it is possible to advertise a particular educational institution very widely and inspire the public with artificially created values. It is impossible to guarantee that this will not happen.”

The results of an international comparative study of achievements, which became an indicator of the quality of general education of students and received a great response, revealed the "weak points" of the German school system and missed opportunities to abandon the outdated mechanism for organizing an educational structure that is not aimed at stimulating personal development. The requirements specified in official documents with an emphasis on the quality of education and their guarantees are the "best-case scenario" for preserving the former school structure.

German researchers note that the well-being of adolescents largely depends on the quality of relationships with other people (relatives, teachers, friends) and parents combined. Trusting relationships with the world around form what can be the basis for constructive cooperation. Without an adult's willingness to deal with an awkward situation and accept help, support, and suggestions for changing a child are in most cases impossible or difficult to implement. This also depends on what educational difficulties, excessive demands or refusal to help cause parents shame and fear.

CONCLUSIONS

Education is one of the foundations for an economically successful and well-functioning society. The German education system, with all its problems, has been repeatedly criticised in recent decades by German researchers. The conducted research identified problematic issues in the German educational system, which was covered by German researchers. It was found that now educational neglect is characterised by the following factors: lack of qualified personnel, which is provoked by an insufficient number of specialities and places of study, and then graduates – university teachers; insufficient funding from the authorities, which affects the level of salaries of teachers, the low level of which does not motivate a few graduates of universities to work in their speciality; pedagogical reforms that aimed to improve the level of education in European countries, but in the case of Germany, their adoption had the opposite effect; insufficient care for the physical health of adolescents, which is manifested in nutrition, cleanliness of educational institutions, availability medical care, etc., which results in, at the slightest, poor health of students, and, consequently, the inability to fully participate in the educational process.

Thus, the solution to the problems of educational neglect in Germany is to implement the following actions: increasing funding to ensure the organisation of the educational process, which will manifest itself in the growing level of salaries of teachers and other employees of the educational sphere; increase the number of quotas in universities that train teachers; renovate higher education institutions, which will contribute to the ability to work and the desire to attend an educational institution in general.

It is also necessary to develop a new curriculum that will meet European standards, but at the same time, not harm the German education system. In addition, it is necessary to ensure social protection for all participants in the educational process, starting with proper medical care. The implementation of the above recommendations should have a positive impact on the German education system.

REFERENCES


Анотація. Актуальність дослідження полягає в необхідності з’ясування причин педагогічної занедбаності підлітків у контексті німецького досвіду та виявлення можливих вирішень цієї проблеми. Мета статті – висвітлити основні погляди німецьких науковців щодо діагностики педагогічної занедбаності та її подальшої корекції. З методологічної точки зору в основу дослідження покладено метод контент-аналізу, який є одним із інструментів проведення кабінетного дослідження. Розглядалися роботи таких вчених, як К. Ліссманн, В. фон Гумбольдт, Р.Д. Прехт, Р. Візнер, Г. Кіндлер. Були виявлені основні проблеми, які наразі забезпечують освітню занедбаність у Німеччині: недостатнє фінансування, відсутність висококваліфікованих кадрів, неправильно обраний напрям розвитку навичок та якостей учнів, низький рівень соціальної безпеки та ін. Важливим чинником є якість взаємовідносин підлітків з іншими людьми (батьками, вчителями, друзьями), а також їхніх батьків з ними. Були окреслені рекомендації щодо вирішення названих вище проблемних питань, в тому полягає практична значимість проведеного дослідження. Зокрема, необхідними є: збільшення фінансування для забезпечення організації освітнього процесу, збільшення кількості кадрів, що гловають освітню систему, але при цьому не шкодять місцевій системі освіти, забезпечення соціального захисту усіх учасників освітнього процесу.

Ключові слова: освітній процес, рівень освіти, висококваліфіковані кадри, Болонська декларація, PISA